

1 ROB BONTA
Attorney General of California
2 MARK R. BECKINGTON
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
3 TODD GRABARSKY
LISA PLANK
4 JANE REILLY
ROBERT L. MEYERHOFF
5 Deputy Attorneys General
State Bar No. 298196
6 300 South Spring Street, Suite 1702
Los Angeles, CA 90013-1230
7 Telephone: (213) 269-6177
Fax: (916) 731-2144
8 E-mail: Robert.Meyerhoff@doj.ca.gov
9 *Attorneys for Rob Bonta in his official capacity as
Attorney General of the State of California*

10 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
11 FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
12

13
14 **MARCO ANTONIO CARRALERO,**
15 **ET AL.;**

16 Plaintiffs,

17 v.

18 **ROB BONTA, IN HIS OFFICIAL**
19 **CAPACITY AS ATTORNEY GENERAL OF**
20 **CALIFORNIA,**

21 Defendant.
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

8:23-cv-01798-MRA-ADS

**DEFENDANT'S ANSWER TO
FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT
FOR DECLARATORY,
INJUNCTIVE, OR OTHER RELIEF**

Courtroom: 10B
Judge: Hon. Mónica Ramírez Almadani
Action Filed: September 26, 2023

Defendant Rob Bonta, in his official capacity as Attorney General of the State of California, submits this answer in response to Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint for Declaratory, Injunctive, or Other Relief (the FAC) (Dkt. No. 64). Defendant hereby answers the FAC, in paragraphs that correspond to the FAC's paragraphs, as follows:¹

INTRODUCTION²

1. Paragraph No. 1. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

2. Paragraph No. 2. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

3. Paragraph No. 3. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

4. Paragraph No. 4. Defendant admits the allegations in this paragraph.

5. Paragraph No. 5. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves, requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required, Defendant denies each and every allegation.

¹ The following responses to each paragraph include responses to any footnotes that may be contained in the relevant paragraph.

² For the convenience of the Court and the parties, Defendant utilizes certain headings as set forth in the FAC. In doing so, Defendant neither admits nor denies any allegations that may be suggested by the FAC's headings.

1 6. Paragraph No. 6. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
2 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
3 allegation.

4 7. Paragraph No. 7. Defendant admits that Plaintiffs challenge subdivisions
5 (5), (7), (8), (9), (10), (11), (12), (13), (15), (16), (17), (19), (20), (22), (23), and
6 (26) of California Penal Code Section 26230. The remaining allegations in this
7 paragraph consist of legal arguments and contentions that require no response, but
8 to the extent a response is required, Defendant denies each and every such
9 allegation.

10 8. Paragraph No. 8. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
11 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
12 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
13 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

14 **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

15 9. Paragraph No. 9. The allegations in this paragraph consist of legal
16 argument and contentions and authorities that require no response, but to the extent
17 a response is required, Defendant denies each and every such allegation.

18 10. Paragraph No. 10. The allegations in this paragraph consist of legal
19 argument and contentions and authorities that require no response, but to the extent
20 a response is required, Defendant denies each and every such allegation.

21 **THE PARTIES**

22 **Individual Plaintiffs**

23 9.³ Paragraph No. 9. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
24 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
25 allegation.

26
27
28 ³ The FAC repeats 9 and 10 as paragraph numbers. For clarity, Defendant's Answer mirrors that repetition.

1 10. Paragraph No. 10. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
2 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
3 allegation.

4 11. Paragraph No. 11. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
5 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
6 allegation.

7 12. Paragraph No. 12. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
8 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
9 allegation.

10 13. Paragraph No. 13. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
11 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
12 allegation.

13 14. Paragraph No. 14. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
14 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
15 allegation.

16 15. Paragraph No. 15. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
17 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
18 allegation.

19 16. Paragraph No. 16. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
20 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
21 allegation.

22 17. Paragraph No. 17. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
23 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
24 allegation.

25 18. Paragraph No. 18. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
26 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
27 allegation.
28

1 19. Paragraph No. 19. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
2 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
3 allegation.

4 20. Paragraph No. 20. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
5 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
6 allegation.

7 21. Paragraph No. 21. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
8 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
9 allegation.

10 22. Paragraph No. 22. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
11 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
12 allegation.

13 23. Paragraph No. 23. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
14 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
15 allegation.

16 24. Paragraph No. 24. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
17 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
18 allegation.

19 25. Paragraph No. 25. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
20 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
21 allegation.

22 26. Paragraph No. 26. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
23 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
24 allegation.

25 27. Paragraph No. 27. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
26 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
27 allegation.
28

1 28. Paragraph No. 28. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
2 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
3 allegation.

4 29. Paragraph No. 29. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
5 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
6 allegation.

7 30. Paragraph No. 30. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
8 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
9 allegation.

10 31. Paragraph No. 31. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
11 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
12 allegation.

13 32. Paragraph No. 32. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
14 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
15 allegation.

16 33. Paragraph No. 33. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
17 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
18 allegation.

19 34. Paragraph No. 34. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
20 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
21 allegation.

22 35. Paragraph No. 35. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
23 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
24 allegation.

25 **Organizational Plaintiffs**

26 36. Paragraph No. 36. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
27 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
28 allegation.

1 37. Paragraph No. 37. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
2 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
3 allegation.

4 37. Paragraph No. 38. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
5 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
6 allegation.

7 39. Paragraph No. 39. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
8 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
9 allegation.

10 40. Paragraph No. 40. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
11 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
12 allegation.

13 41. Paragraph No. 41. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
14 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
15 allegation.

16 42. Paragraph No. 42. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
17 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
18 allegation.

19 43. Paragraph No. 43. Defendant admits that Rob Bonta is the Attorney
20 General of the State of California, that he is the chief law officer of California, and
21 that he has various duties under California law. Defendant further admits that the
22 Department of Justice maintains an office in Los Angeles, California. The
23 remaining allegations in this paragraph consist of legal arguments and contentions
24 that require no response, but to the extent a response is required, Defendant denies
25 each and every such allegation.

26 **GENERAL ALLEGATIONS**

27 44. Paragraph No. 44. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
28 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,

1 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
2 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

3 45. Paragraph No. 45. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
4 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
5 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
6 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

7 46. Paragraph No. 46. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
8 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
9 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
10 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

11 47. Paragraph No. 47. Defendant admits that the California Legislature
12 passed SB2 in September 2023, that the bill took effect on January 1, 2024, and that
13 Governor Newsom used the word “absurdity” in reference to *New York State Rifle*
14 *& Pistol Ass’n v. Bruen*, 142 S. Ct. 2111 (2022) and described *Bruen* as a “bad
15 ruling.” Except as expressly admitted, Defendant lacks sufficient information or
16 belief to respond to the remaining allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis
17 denies each and every such remaining allegation.

18 48. Paragraph No. 48. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
19 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
20 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
21 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

22 49. Paragraph No. 49. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
23 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
24 requiring no response by Defendant. Except as alleged, Defendant lacks sufficient
25 information or belief to respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that
26 basis denies each and every allegation.

27 50. Paragraph No. 50. This paragraph consists of an allegation that contains
28 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,

1 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
2 Defendant denies the allegation.

3 51. Paragraph No. 51. This paragraph consists of an allegation that contains
4 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
5 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
6 Defendant denies the allegation.

7 52. Paragraph No. 52. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
8 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
9 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
10 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

11 53. Paragraph No. 53. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
12 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
13 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
14 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

15 54. Paragraph No. 54. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
16 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
17 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
18 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

19 55. Paragraph No. 55. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
20 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
21 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
22 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

23 56. Paragraph No. 56. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
24 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
25 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
26 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

27 57. Paragraph No. 57. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
28 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,

1 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
2 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

3 **CLAIM FOR RELIEF**

4 **VIOLATION OF 42 U.S.C. § 1983 (SECOND AMENDMENT)**

5 58. Paragraph No. 58. Defendant incorporates by reference the answers in
6 Paragraphs 1 through 57 above.

7 59. Paragraph No. 59. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
8 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
9 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
10 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

11 60. Paragraph No. 60. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
12 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
13 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
14 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

15 61. Paragraph No. 61. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
16 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
17 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
18 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

19 62. Paragraph No. 62. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
20 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
21 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
22 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

23 63. Paragraph No. 63. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
24 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
25 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
26 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

27 64. Paragraph No. 64. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
28 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,

1 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
2 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

3 65. Paragraph No. 65. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
4 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
5 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
6 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

7 66. Paragraph No. 66. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
8 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
9 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
10 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

11 67. Paragraph No. 67. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
12 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
13 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
14 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

15 68. Paragraph No. 68. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
16 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
17 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
18 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

19 69. Paragraph No. 69. This paragraph consists of allegations that contain
20 argument and legal contentions and legal authorities that speak for themselves,
21 requiring no response by Defendant. To the extent that a response is required,
22 Defendant denies each and every allegation.

23 70. Paragraph No. 70. Defendant lacks sufficient information or belief to
24 respond to the allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies each and every
25 allegation.

26 //

27 //

28

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

Defendant denies that Plaintiffs are entitled to the relief set forth in the Prayer for Relief immediately following paragraph 70, or to any relief whatsoever. To the extent that the Prayer for Relief states any allegations, Defendant denies them.

In addition, without admitting any allegations contained in the FAC, Defendant asserts the following defenses based on information and belief:

FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

The FAC, and the claims for relief alleged therein, fails to state facts sufficient to constitute a cause of action against Defendant.

SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiffs' claims in this action are barred in that Plaintiffs do not have standing to bring them.

THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

The FAC, and each cause of action therein, is improper as Plaintiffs have an adequate remedy at law.

FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

The FAC, and every cause of action therein, is barred by the equitable doctrines of estoppel, laches, unclean hands, and/or waiver.

FIFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

To the extent that Defendant has undertaken any conduct with regard to the subjects and events underlying Plaintiffs' FAC, such conduct was, at all times material thereto, undertaken in good faith and in reasonable reliance on existing law.

SIXTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Defendant has not knowingly or intentionally waived any applicable affirmative defense. Defendant reserves the right to assert and rely upon other such defenses as may become available or apparent during discovery proceedings or as may be raised or asserted by others in this case, and to amend the Answer and/or

1 affirmative defenses accordingly. Defendant further reserves the right to amend the
2 Answer to delete affirmative defenses that they determine are not applicable after
3 subsequent discovery.

4 WHEREFORE, Defendant prays that:

- 5 1. Plaintiffs take nothing by reason of the FAC;
6 2. Judgment be entered in favor of Defendant;
7 3. Defendant be awarded costs incurred in defending this action; and
8 4. Defendant be awarded such further relief that the Court may deem just and
9 proper.

10 Dated: April 2, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

11
12 ROB BONTA
13 Attorney General of California
14 MARK R. BECKINGTON
15 Supervising Deputy Attorney General

16 /s/ Robert L. Meyerhoff
17 ROBERT L. MEYERHOFF
18 Deputy Attorney General

19 *Attorneys for Rob Bonta in his official*
20 *capacity as Attorney General for the*
21 *State of California*
22
23
24
25
26
27
28